**AGENDA**
**TOWN OF JUPITER ISLAND**
**BEACH PROTECTION DISTRICT MEETING**
**WEDNESDAY, JANUARY 8, 2025**
**ISLAND ROOM – TOWN HALL – 2 BRIDGE ROAD**

1. **Consent Agenda**

   **Category A- To be reviewed and approved (as is or as edited) by the Town Commission**

   a. Minutes of the December 4, 2024, Beach Protection District Meeting

2. **Beach Project Update***

3. **Turtle Monitoring Program**

4. **Beach Status***

5. **Other Items***

** No advanced materials provided*

**Town Commission**
Penny Townsend, Mayor
Marshall Field, VI, Vice Mayor
Anne Scott, Commissioner
Patricia Warner, Commissioner
Joseph Taddeo, Commissioner

**Town Staff**
Town Manager, Robert Garlo
Town Attorney, Thomas J. Baird
Town Clerk, Kimberly Kogos

**STATE MANDATED STATEMENT**

If a person decides to appeal any decision made by the board, agency, or commission with respect to any matter considered at such meeting or hearing, he will need a record of the proceedings, and that, for such purpose, he may need to ensure that a verbatim record of the proceedings is made, which record includes the testimony and evidence upon which the appeal is to be based. Any person requiring a special accommodation at this meeting because of a disability or physical impairment should contact the Town prior to the meeting. Please contact the Town Hall, 2 Bridge Road, Hobe Sound, FL 33455, telephone (772) 545-0103.

**MINUTES**
**TOWN OF JUPITER ISLAND**
**BEACH PROTECTION DISTRICT MEETING**
**WEDNESDAY, DECEMBER 4, 2024**

**TIME:** Wednesday, December 4, 2024 – 10:00 AM
**PLACE:** Town Hall Island Room – 2 Bridge Rd., Hobe Sound, FL
**PRESENT:** Present were Mayor Penny Townsend, Vice Mayor Marshall Field VI, and Commissioners Anne Scott, Patricia Warner and Joseph Taddeo. Also present were Town Manager Robert Garlo, Town Clerk Kimberly Kogos, Town Attorney Thomas Baird and IT Director Bill Sutton.

## 1. Consent Agenda

**Category A- To be reviewed and approved (as is or as edited) by the Town Commission**

a. Minutes of the November 6, 2024, Beach Protection District Meeting

***MOTION:*** ***Vice Mayor Field/Commissioner Scott moved to approve the consent agenda as presented.***
***ACTION:*** ***Motion Passed 5-0.***

## 2. Martin County Local Mitigation Strategy (LMS) Presentation*

Director Duchcok provided an explanation of the Local Mitigation Strategy (LMS) program and introduced Ms. Amy Lopez, Deputy Director for Martin County Emergency Management Agency.

She greeted the Commission and provided a brief presentation of the purpose of the LMS program. Dealing mostly with floods, hurricanes, and storms. Other hazards include wildfires, drought, shoreline erosion, algal blooms, and cyberterrorism.

The LMS Plan is updated every five (5) years (2020-2025) and the Town will need to adopt the new plan, once approved by the state. They are currently working with a subcommittee to revise hazards (adding pandemics), update events and project criteria with public involvement.

The local project includes SMRU reverse osmosis treatment plant generator - the estimated cost $1,052,889. Grant funding is available, but the Town would be responsible for approximately 12.5% of the cost.

Director Duchock stated that this information may be provided to the residents, including the survey provided by the County. The Commission agreed.

Commissioner Taddeo asked about other projects that are on the list. Director Duchock added that there are storm water refits, hardening and storm proofing on emergency facilities, etc.

## 3. Beach Project Update*

Director Duchock showed a picture of the beach project vessel used by Weeks Marine. He provided a beach project summary stating the the project includes excavation of 1,200,000 cy of beach quality sand from offshore Borrow Site "B", with a construction cost of $28,565,000. He explained that placement of

sand will include two fill sections, one on the north side, 1.9 miles, and one on the south side, 5.1 miles. He explained the 2024-2025 project layout and timeline. He displayed a visual of the hydraulic hopper dredge vessel used during the project and explained the technical aspects of the project. He reviewed the permit requirements for the project including endangered species monitors, pipeline inspections. hardbottom surveys, etc. He reviewed the estimated construction schedule, beginning the week of December 15, 2024, and continuing to May 1, 2025.

Discussion ensued regarding the impact to wildlife from the borrow site area. Director Duchock explained that surveys are conducted in order to protect ocean species as much as possible and explained additional measures to assist in protection.

Additional discussion ensued pertaining to future borrow sites.

## 4. Turtle Monitoring Program*

Director Duchock explained the current Turtle Monitoring Program and new legislative requirements for the program. He noted the two options being advanced to address the issue including:

- Shifting the Town program to a different department with a new full-time management position
- Open solicitation for a new contract for services (bids due December 20, 2024)

He explained that staff will provide a recommendation to the Commission at the January 8th meeting.

Commissioner Taddeo revisited the sand/borrow site issue and asked if there is someone from the state that the Town may speak with. Director Duchock and consultant Kelly Layman provided feedback that there is a team at the DEP monitoring this. There are other sources available, but they are on a federal project that at this time the Town cannot address.

## 5. Beach Conditions Report*

Director Duchock provided an update on the beach status over the last 30 days including wave heights, widespread escarpments, isolated loss of dune toes in hot spot areas, active hotspot areas as well as potential hotspot areas. He stated that beach conditions have experienced minor to moderate erosion over the last 30 days. He continued by displaying aerial drone footage of the shoreline and beach level photographs where appropriate to better display escarpments.

## 6. Other Items*

No other items were discussed.

Mayor Townsend adjourned the meeting at 10:58am.

Respectfully Submitted,

Kimberly Kogos, Town Clerk

TOWN OF JUPITER ISLAND

MEMORANDUM

TO: Mayor & Town Commission

THROUGH: Robert Garlo, Town Manager

CC: Kimberly Kogos, Town Clerk

FROM: John Duchock, Asst. Town Manager/Beach District Director

RE: Agenda Item 3.: Turtle Monitoring Program (ITB#2025-01)

DATE: 12/30/2024

Background:

The Joint Coastal Permit (JCP) issued by the Florida Department of Environmental Protection (FDEP) for the Town's beach nourishment program includes requirements to survey, monitoring, and protect threatened and endangered sea turtles and shorebirds. Those activities include daily surveys for sea turtle nesting activity beginning no later than March 1st and ending on October 31st each year, as well as marking and tracking of nests laid over the season. Additionally, the Town is required to conduct night-time monitoring during construction (if nesting has occurred) and must also complete weekly escarpment surveys and two night-time lighting inspections during the turtle nesting season. Similarly, the Town is required to conduct bi-monthly shorebird surveys along the entire length of the Town's nourished beach.

The importance of the turtle monitoring program cannot be understated as it is one of the key elements of the Town's permit to conduct beach nourishment. Over the decades that the Town has conducted nourishment, sea turtle nesting activity has risen to levels that now place Jupiter Island's beach as one of the highest density nesting beaches in the United States. Prior to 2013, the Town utilized outside contract employees to conduct this work. In 2013 the contract employees became part-time employees of the Town and have provided invaluable support to the Town's beach program under increasingly demanding conditions. Those demands have come in the form of requests by the Florida Fish and Wildlife Conservation Commission (FWC) to increase the number of monitoring personnel and to adopt newer technologies for data collection. Most recently, the FWC notified the Town that the current organizational structure of the turtle monitoring program must change to be compliant with State rule. Specifically, turtle monitoring activities cannot be conducted as part of a beach management program. To remedy this would require the Town to shift the monitors to a different (new) department and to hire a full-time manager to run the program independent of the Beach Protection District.

The estimated annual cost to implement all FWC requests for restructuring the Town's in-house program is approximately $250,000/yr, not including additional costs related to construction monitoring and annual adjustments for inflation/cost of living.

As presented to the Commission during previous Beach Protection District meetings, an alternative approach would be to revert back to contracting the service to a qualified third-party. In order to assess this option, Town staff solicited bids for a multi-year contract (2025-2029) to conduct all permit-required sea turtle and shorebird monitoring through an Invitation to Bid (ITB#2025-01). Sealed responses were received and opened on December 20, 2024. Three companies responded to the solicitation and provided the following itemized bid prices:

| WORK ITEM | Bio-Tech | Ecological Associates | DB Ecological |
|---|---|---|---|
| Marine Turtle Monitoring Annual | $191,758.00 | $175,788.39 | $286,751.28 |
| Nest Fate Annual | $46,950.00 | $31,533.50 | $400.00 |
| Night-Time Construction | $58,690.00 | $135,281.05 | $67,125.00 |
| Escarpment & Lighting Surveys Annual | $16,920.00 | $18,133.60 | $637.00 |
| Shorebird Monitoring Annual | $14,181.00 | $7,363.47 | $2,040.00 |

All bids were reviewed by Town staff for pricing verification and to confirm qualifications. The total costs for a proposed multi-year contract (beginning 2025 and ending 2029) are: Bio-Tech ($1,466,425.00); Ecological Associates ($1,434,656.90); DB Ecological ($1,581,351.40). Based on this, Ecological Associates is the lowest qualified bidder.

Prices under this contract would remain fixed for the 2025-2029 term of service. Ecological Associates annualized costs, including night-time construction monitoring of the 2025 beach project and another project in 2029, would be $286,931.38 (average per year) – 10%-15% higher than the estimated annual in-house cost.

Requested Action:

A detailed breakdown of the projected costs (2025-2029), as well as a summary of the pros and cons for contracted versus in-house program options are attached for reference, highlighting key regulatory, staffing, and logistical considerations. Based on these, Town staff recommends outsourcing the turtle and shorebird monitoring program. Staff recommends approval and execution of a contract with Ecological Associates, subject to Town counsel review for legal sufficiency, to provide sea turtle and shorebird monitoring services. Further, staff requests authorization for services required for the 2025 monitoring season in an amount not to exceed $368,100.01.

# BID TABULATION AND PROJECTED IN-HOUSE COSTS
2025-2029

| | Bid Costs | Total 5 Year Cost Comparison | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| Item | **ECOLOGICAL ASS.** | | **ECOLOGICAL ASS.** | **TJI** |
| Marine Turtle Annual 2025 | $ 175,788.39 | | | |
| Nest Fate Annual 2025 | $ 31,533.50 | | | |
| Night-Time Construction | $ 135,281.05 | Total Costs 2025 | $ 368,100.01 | $ 263,006.77 |
| Escarpment Annual 2025 | $ 18,133.60 | *Cost Difference (%)* | 39.96% | |
| Shorebird Annual 2025 | $ 7,363.47 | *Cost Difference ($)* | $ 105,093.24 | |
| Marine Turtle Annual 2026 | $ 175,788.39 | | | |
| Nest Fate Annual 2026 | $ 31,533.50 | Total Costs 2026 | $ 232,818.96 | $ 240,039.86 |
| Escarpment Annual 2026 | $ 18,133.60 | *Cost Difference (%)* | -3.01% | |
| Shorebird Annual 2025 | $ 7,363.47 | *Cost Difference ($)* | $ (7,220.90) | |
| Marine Turtle Annual 2027 | $ 175,788.39 | | | |
| Nest Fate Annual 2027 | $ 31,533.50 | Total Costs 2027 | $ 232,818.96 | $ 246,656.05 |
| Escarpment Annual 2027 | $ 18,133.60 | *Cost Difference (%)* | -5.61% | |
| Shorebird Annual 2027 | $ 7,363.47 | *Cost Difference ($)* | $ (13,837.09) | |
| Marine Turtle Annual 2028 | $ 175,788.39 | | | |
| Nest Fate Annual 2028 | $ 31,533.50 | Total Costs 2028 | $ 232,818.96 | $ 253,470.73 |
| Escarpment Annual 2028 | $ 18,133.60 | *Cost Difference (%)* | -8.15% | |
| Shorebird Annual 2028 | $ 7,363.47 | *Cost Difference ($)* | $ (20,651.77) | |
| Marine Turtle Annual 2029 | $ 175,788.39 | | | |
| Nest Fate Annual 2029 | $ 31,533.50 | | | |
| Night-Time Construction | $ 135,281.05 | Total Costs 2029 | $ 368,100.01 | $ 293,573.06 |
| Escarpment Annual 2029 | $ 18,133.60 | *Cost Difference (%)* | 25.39% | |
| Shorebird Annual 2029 | $ 7,363.47 | *Cost Difference ($)* | $ 74,526.95 | |
| | | | | |
| **2025-2029 Monitoring Total** | **$ 1,434,656.90** | 5-Year Total Costs | $ 1,434,656.90 | $1,296,746.48 |
| | | *Cost Difference (%)* | *10.64%* | |
| | | *Cost Difference ($)* | *$ 137,910.42* | |
| | | *Avg. Annual Cost ($)* | *$ 286,931.38* | *$ 259,349.30* |
| | | *Avg. Annual Difference($)* | $ 27,582.08 | |

SEA TURTLE & SHOREBIRD MONITORING
PROS & CONS SUMMARY

| | Retaining In-House Program | Outsourcing Program |
|---|---|---|
| PROS | • Lower cost compared to contract ($25,000-$30,000/yr avg)<br>• Prestige of continuing a long-standing program<br>• Direct control of fate with respect to completing permit-required monitoring<br>• Retention of institutional knowledge<br>• Labor eligible for grants | • Satisfies State Rule for separation of turtle monitoring from beach management<br>• Less FWC involvement/direction<br>• More resources for staffing without Town HR support<br>• Eliminates need to purchase and maintain vehicles/equipment<br>• Reduces liability exposure to workman's comp/injury claims<br>• All contracted costs are eligible for grants |
| CONS | • New Town department and FTE (manager) required to satisfy State Rule<br>• Increased staffing requested by FWC for peak season nest survey and inventory<br>• Increase staffing requires additional ATVs and equipment to be purchased<br>• Continued challenges with recruiting/maintaining active part-time employees<br>• Continued requirement to acquire, store, and maintain vehicles, equipment, and supplies<br>• Maintenance of vehicles requires additional Town staff support from outside of the department (Public Works transport)<br>• Continued requirement to train employees<br>• Vehicles, equipment, and supplies are not eligible for grants<br>• Office space is not currently available | • Higher costs (10%-15%) over keeping program in-house<br>• Continued need to manage contractor work and delivery to maintain permit<br>• Potential loss of institutional knowledge<br>• Future contracting required with anticipated cost increases |